

<sup>8</sup>Protea Atlas Project, South African National Biodiversity Institute, Cape

Town, South Africa

#### **Summary (A)**

 While poleward species migration in response to recent climatic warming is widely documented, few studies have examined entire range responses of broadly distributed sessile organisms, including both trailing (equatorward) and leading (poleward) range edges.

 From a detailed population census of *Aloe dichotoma* Masson, a long-lived Namib Desert tree-aloe, we present six pieces of evidence of a developing range shift in this species, most parsimoniously explained by population level impacts of observed regional warming and resulting water balance constraints. Equatorward population declines are broadly consistent with bioclimatically-modelled projections under anticipated anthropogenic climate change, but are not accompanied by modelled poleward range extension.

 This study is the first to show a marked lag between trailing edge population extinction and slow leading edge range expansion in a species experiencing anthropogenic climate change impacts, a pattern likely to apply to most sessile and poorly dispersed organisms. This provides support for making conservative assumptions of migration rate when modelling climate change impacts for such species. *Aloe dichotoma*'s response to climate change suggests that desert ecosystems may be more sensitive to climate change than previously suspected.

## **Keywords (A)**

Bioclimatic modelling; desertification; extinction; global warming fingerprints;

migration; range shift

# **Introduction (A)**

59 Studies of the responses of terrestrial organisms to latter 20<sup>th</sup> century warming have focussed on range shifts of motile organisms [e.g.1-4], stressing poleward range boundary extensions [1], or non-lethal changes in the growth patterns of sessile organisms [5-8]. Both types of studies have focused most frequently on only a portion of a species'range. However, there is concern that the adaptive responses of sessile organisms to rapid climate change may be constrained, causing population extinctions at the so-called "trailing edge" of species' geographic ranges that are shifting in response to a changing climate [9]. Trailing edge extinctions should be first detected in terrestrial organisms that occupy extreme climatic environments such as deserts, where climate-related stresses exert direct control over population processes, especially at range margins [10]. It is implicitly assumed by bioclimatic modelling approaches that trailing edge extinctions will be accompanied by simultaneous leading edge range expansions [1], but lags due to limiting rates of dispersal, establishment and population expansions [11] are a significant threat to this assumption, especially for sessile species. Such constraints are likely to squeeze the ranges of non-motile organisms between a zone of population die-back and of constrained expansion, thereby raising their risk of extinction, at least temporarily, even if climate change trends begin to stabilize.

 Here we demonstrate impacts of regional climate change on population die-back in the Namib desert tree (*Aloe dichotoma*), almost certainly through induced water

 balance constraints, in a spatial pattern consistent with the expected signal of anthropogenic climate change (i.e. higher mortality in equatorial trailing edge sites). The pattern of die-back provides credible evidence of the negative impacts of anthropogenic climate change on sessile organisms, especially as it is linked with observed regional climatic changes and is consistent with model projections of anthropogenic climate change impacts. However, we find no evidence yet of poleward range expansion, and only weak evidence of population expansion in poleward populations, demonstrating a lag between trailing edge die-back and leading edge expansionthat may pose a serious threat to the long-term persistence of this and other sessile or poorly-dispersed species.

 We conducted a detailed population census and related studies on this long-lived giant succulent plant throughout its entire geographic range in the Namib Desert and adjacent arid regions of Southern Africa, a region projected to experience significant warming and drying due to anthropogenic climate change [12]. The sizeable stem- succulent growth form, succulent leaves and shallow root systems of this species are common adaptations for rapid absorption and storage of water to allow survival of frequent droughts [13,14]. Individuals grow up to 10m tall and usually occur in dense populations of up to 10 000 trees. A long life span (approximately 200 years [15], 99 and expansive range (21°-31° South, ~200 000 km<sup>2</sup>) make this a useful species for studying significant long-term climate trends. In particular, because dead trees decay slowly in the arid Namib climate (as revealed by repeat photography), we were able to obtain a consistent relative measure of population mortality throughout the species' range.

- **Results (A)**
- 

 We examined 53 populations throughout the entire geographic range of the species 109 and found that population-level mortality ranged between 2% and 71% (mean=32.1  $\pm$  20.0%, see Fig. 1), with a significant trend of decreasing mortality from the equatorial to the poleward regions of the species' range (*r*=0.393, *n*=53, *p*<0.004; see Fig. 2). A regression of the residuals from this analysis against the altitude of each population also produced a significant trend (*r*=0.331,*n*=53, *p*<0.016) – showing that low-altitude (warmer) equatorial populations are approaching localised extinction, while high altitude (cooler) populations have experienced lower mortality. Populations at poleward and high altitude extremes tended to experience only minimal mortality. Thus population level mortality decreased along latitudinal and altitudinal clines in a pattern consistent with that expected under climate change, with the highest mortality generally in the "trailing edge" [9] of the species' geographic range.

 Repeat photographs also suggest a latitudinal cline in *Aloe dichotoma* mortality. We examined a series of 22 photographs of nine *Aloe dichotoma* populations taken between 1904 and 1918 and precisely matched these with repeat photographs in 2002. The six northernmost populations have experienced declines in population numbers of between 1.5% and 8% per decade but the three southernmost populations have increased in numbers by between 4% and 17% per decade (Fig. 3). The altitudinal range between the sites (300m) is too small to infer an altitudinal cline but we found a clear relationship between latitude and mortality rate (the fraction of deaths in percent of observed individuals per century) (*r*= –0.906, *n*=9, *p*<0.001).

 What might be causing adult mortality in these populations? In a large number of *Aloe dichotoma* individuals, we observed that terminal leaf rosettes slowly withered and eventually dropped to the ground, while the apical tips of supporting branches died under drought conditions (we term this "shoot shedding"). These branches never re-developed leaves, presumably due to the loss of apical meristem. Our field

 observations and anecdotal evidence from local experts strongly suggests that shoot shedding is a typical response to water deficits in this species [16]. We found a strong logarithmic relationship between the mean percentage of individuals' canopies lost to shoot shedding and population mortality (*r*=0.777, *n*=24, *p*=0.00), suggesting that high-mortality populations are experiencing long term water stress.

 Water stress in plants is the result of the interaction between precipitation and atmospheric vapour pressure deficit, itself a function of air temperature and relative humidity. Desert rainfall is variable and unsuited to trend analysis especially given the length of records available, but atmospheric warming is more reliably detected. Increasing air temperature is a key controller of plant water status, and would increase the rate of water loss from the succulent leaves of this CAM-photosynthetic species, especially during its night-time stomatal opening period, thereby hastening leaf and shoot desiccation.

 Continental scale analyses of temperature records for the last century indicate that the Namib has undergone an increase in temperature as well as a reduction in precipitation [12]. Local climatic records revealed significant regional climate warming. We examined temperature and rainfall records from all available long-term weather stations in the regions in which *Aloe dichotoma* occurs. Fifty three percent of stations showed significant increases in temperature over the last 25-60 years while none showed a significant decline. The mean decadal increase across all 158 stations during this interval was  $0.2 \pm 0.1^{\circ}$ C. Water balance, a composite measure of temperature and rainfall reflecting the water available to plants, showed a significant decline at 33% of stations over the last 25-60 years. No stations showed a significant increase in water balance over this period. The relative severity of cumulative water stress in *Aloe dichotoma* is reflected by the percentage of months during the past decade in which water balance fell below –90 mm. Furthermore,

 population mortality at study sites within 100km of the long-term weather stations is positively correlated with cumulative water stress (*r*=0.491, *n*=22, *p*<0.021), strongly suggesting that a combination of water and heat stress is responsible for the increased mortality in declining *Aloe dichotoma* populations.

 Where atmospheric warming is the chief cause of localised extinction we would expect lower mortality in cooler microhabitats. To test this hypothesis, we selected populations occurring on extensive steep slopes, and assigned all live and dead trees to one of three roughly equal-sized altitude categories, namely lower, middle and upper slopes. Combining results from all sites, we found significantly higher 174 mortality than expected on lower, warmer slopes  $(\chi^2 = 21.49, d.f. = 2, p<0.00002)$ . This result is consistent with a climate change explanation of mortality, and confirms that, even at a local scale, individuals in cooler climatic refuges (i.e. higher altitude) have a lower probability of mortality.

 We examined all other reasonable explanations for the observed mortality patterns in *Aloe dichotoma*, such as intra-specific competition, pathogen infection, pollution damage or exposure to human or animal persecution. We found no relationship between mortality and tree density or the degree of pathogen infection of trunks or leaves. Although the areas in which *Aloe dichotoma* occurs are too arid for agriculture, parts of its range are used for stock and game farming. The species is considered to be unpalatable, yet we observed a degree of herbivory by sheep, goats, donkeys, antelope, baboons and porcupine, but no correlation between canopy herbivory and population mortality. We found mortality to be weakly related to degree of stem bark damage, presumably by herbivores (*r*=0.406, *n*= 35, *p*<0.02), but as it is unrelated to herbivore density (measured as the frequency of dung pellets in the area; *r*=0.11, *n*=28, *p*>0.56) we conclude that some herbivory of *Aloe dichotoma* trunks (likely by porcupines) probably occurs only under conditions of

 extreme drought when more palatable food and water sources are unavailable, resulting in a weak auto-correlation between stem bark damage and population mortality.

 Finally, niche-based spatial modelling techniques [17], utilising the sampled distribution and climatic surfaces at a resolution of 10 minutes were used to derive *Aloe dichotoma*'s current and future modelled ranges, assuming widely-used projections of anthropogenic climate change [18]. The modelled frequency of occurrence of *Aloe dichotoma* within each 10 minutes of latitude for the years 2000 and 2050 (see Fig. 4A) indicates a projected poleward shift in this species' 202 geographic range. The trend of progressive projected range decline with decreasing latitude is similar to the latitudinal trend in measured mortality of sampled populations (Fig. 4B), strongly suggesting that anthropogenic warming underlies the negative trends in population persistence in this species in the equatorial regions of its geographic range.

 The mean altitude of 10' pixels in which climate change models project the species' 209 presence increases from 806  $\pm$  354 m in 2000 to 885  $\pm$  329 m in 2050 while the 210 projected mean latitude shifts from  $26.68 \pm 2.81$  degrees South in 2000 to 27.90  $\pm$  2.5 degrees South in 2050. These modelled shifts equate to a mean altitudinal increase of 16m per decade and a poleward range shift of 23 km per decade, 213 considerably higher than the 6.1  $\pm$  2.4 km per decade poleward range shifts recently collated [2].

 No records exist of new populations of this highly prized species establishing in areas projected to become suitable for the species in the poleward parts of its range, even though it has been successfully planted and recruits autonomously in more poleward locations [19]. Within-population recruitment (i.e. the percentage of individuals in the

 population <1m in height) was generally low, but ranged from 0.0 % to 40.4% (mean=10.1 ± 9.9%), showing a weak negative relationship with latitude (*r*=-0.26, *n*=53, *P*>0.064).

# **Discussion (A)**

 These results suggest that *Aloe dichotoma*, a species with an extended juvenile period, may be experiencing the earliest stages of poleward expansion, but that low rates of juvenile recruitment, individual plant growth and dispersal limit migration in relation to its shifting climatic envelope. The geographic range of *Aloe dichotoma* is becoming squeezed between an equatorward zone of rapid range contraction due to population extinctions, and a poleward zone of lagging range expansion. This study is the first to document a lag in leading edge range expansion, but the pattern is likely to be repeated for sessile and poorly dispersed organisms globally.

 Many projections of climate change impacts on biodiversity attempt to incorporate uncertainty due to migration constraints by contrasting "full migration" and "null migration" assumptions [e.g.17,20,21]. These findings provide strong support for conservative assumptions of migration rate in sessile organisms, and have large implications for projections of global species' diversity loss.

 The Succulent Karoo, the planet's only arid biodiversity hotspot [22], contains over 5 000 species, 40% of which are endemic [23]. This hotspot lies almost entirely within the range of *Aloe dichotoma*. Although it is extremely widespread and abundant, *Aloe dichotoma* qualifies as Vulnerable (criterion A3c,e) according to the IUCN Red List Assessment criteria, based on population loss corresponding to modelled range loss under a "null migration" scenario. Succulence, gigantism and a broad distribution range probably make *Aloe dichotoma* particularly robust to drought and climatic

 fluctuation, and the species provides a conservative indicator of climatic warming in the Namib region. While insufficient data are available to model range shifts of all species, it seems likely that doing so would result in a drastic increase in the number of species qualifying as Threatened (defined as "in immediate danger of extinction") according the IUCN Red Listing criteria. A large and rapid shift in conservation approach is clearly needed.

 Desert ecosystems are frequently perceived as more tolerant of global warming and a recent global assessment suggests that they will show a relatively muted biodiversity response to climate change [24]. The results of this study argue strongly against this conclusion and suggest that desert ecosystems are likely to become increasingly hostile and species-poor with intensifying global warming.

# **Materials and Methods (A)**

## Aloe population characteristics (B)

 We selected large, discreet populations and measured 100 live individuals in the densest part of each. We measured smaller populations where they made an 267 important contribution to describing the species' range and no larger ones could be found. In these cases we measured the entire population. Estimates for each individual included degree of fungal pathogen infection of leaves and trunk (scores); extent of animal damage to the stem or trunk (score); the percentage of the total 271 potential canopy removed and the percentage of the total potential canopy in which leaf abscission occurred. 

 The number of dead trees within the area covered by the 100 sampled live trees was 275 used to derive the percentage of each population's mortality. We used a  $1,000 \times 3$ 

 metre transect through the population to derive an estimate of population density. This also provided a second estimate of relative mortality and this was generally in agreement with the first estimate.

#### Photographs (B)

 Mortality within the photographed populations was calculated as *M = [D/(D+S)] [n*/ *100yrs] [100 %];* where: *M* = mortality rate expressed as the fraction of deaths in 283 percent of observed individuals per century;  $D =$  number of dead individuals;  $S =$ 284 number of surviving individuals; and  $n =$  number of years between photographs.

# Climate records (B)

 We used data from all stations in Namibia and north-western South Africa from which temperature records of 24 or more years are available (15 stations). We tested for stationarity by visually assessing deviance from a straight line when cumulative temperature and rainfall values for neighbouring stations were plotted against each other [25]. Water Balance was calculated as the difference between precipitation and potential evapotranspiration [26] based on monthly means of mean daily temperature and total monthly precipitation. Annual trends (calculated from April to March in order to represent a growth year) were analysed using Robust MM Regression [27].

 Eleven stations had water balance data for more than 12 of the last 15 years. Eight of these stations were within 100km of one or more study populations and these were used for comparison with *Aloe dichotoma* population mortality (22 populations). A single coastal station was removed from the analysis as the steep environmental gradient away from the coast makes it unrepresentative of conditions at inland populations.

## Bioclimatic modelling (B)

 The CRU CL 2.0 dataset [28] was used to represent current climate. Future (2050) climate modeling was based on the moderate prediction of climate change produced by the HADCM3 General Circulation Model [29] using the B2 IPCC SRES scenario [30]. BIOMOD [18,31], a biodiversity modeling tool was used to produce scenarios of the possible impacts of climate change on *Aloe dichotoma's* range. **References (A)** 1. Parmesan, C., Ryrholm N., Stefanescu, C., Hill, J.K., Thomas, C.D., et al. (1999) Poleward shifts in geographical ranges of butterfly species associated with regional warming. *Nature*, **399**, 578-583. 2. Parmesan, C. & Yohe, G. (2003) A globally coherent fingerprint of climate change impacts across natural systems. *Nature*, **421**, 37-42. 3. Warren, M.S., Hill, J.K., Thomas, J.A., Asher, J. & Fox, R. (2001) Rapid responses of British butterflies to opposing forces of climate and habitat change. *Nature,* **414**, 65-69. 4. Hersteinsson, P. & MacDonald, D.W. (1992) Interspecific competition and the geographical distribution of red and artic foxes *Vulpes vulpes* and *Alopex lagopus. Oikos*, **64**, 505-515. 5. Fitter, A.H. & Fitter, R.S.R. (2002) Rapid changes in flowering time in British plants. *Science*, **296**,1689-1691. 6. Keeling, C.D., Chin, J.F.S. & Whorf, T.P. (1996) Increased activity of northern vegetation inferred from atmospheric CO<sup>2</sup> measurements. *Nature*, **382**, 146-149. 7. Abu-Asab, M.S., Peterson, P.M., Schelter S.G. & Orli, S.S. (2001) Earlier plant flowering in spring as a response to global warming in the Washington, DC, area. *Biodiversity and Conservation*, **10**, 597-612. 8. Menzel, A. & Fabian, P. (1999) Growing season extended in Europe. *Nature*, **397**, 659. 9. Davis, M.B. & Shaw, R.G. (2001) Range shifts and adaptive responses to Quaternary climate change. *Science*, **292**, 673-679.

- 10. Jordan, P.W. & Nobel, P.S. (1979) Infrequent establishment of seedlings of
- *Agave deserti* (Agavaceae) in the northwest Sonoran desert. *American Journal of Botany*, **66**, 74-76.
- 11. Pitelka, F. (1997) Plant migration and climate change. *American Scientist*. **85**,
- 12. Hulme, M., Doherty, R., Ngara, T., New, M. & Lister, D. (2001) African climate
- change: 1900-2100. *Climate Research*, **17**,145-168.
- 13. Barkhuisen, B.P. (1978) *Succulents of Southern Africa*. Purnell, Cape Town.
- 14. Jacobsen, H. (1960) *A handbook of succulent plants*. Blandford Press,
- London.
- 15. Vogel, J.C. (1974) The life span of the Kokerboom. *Aloe*, **12**, 66-68.
- 16. van Jaarsveld, A.S. & Chown, S.L. (2001) Climate change and its impact in
- South Africa. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, **16**, 13-14.
- 17. Thuiller, W. (2004) Patterns and uncertainties of species'range shifts under climate change. *Global Change Biology*, **10**, 2020-2027.
- 18. IPCC Climate Change 2001: Impacts, adaptation, and vulnerability.
- *Contribution of Working Group II to the Third Assessment Report of the*
- *Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*, (ed. by J.J. McCarthy, O.F. Canziani,
- N.A. Leary, D.J. Dokken and K.S. White). Cambridge University Press, New York.
- 19. pers. comm., Ian Oliver (curator), Karoo Desert Botanical Garden, Worcester,
- Cape Province, South Africa.
- 20. Peterson, A.T., Ortega-Huerta, M.A., Bartley, J., Sanchez-Cordero, V.,
- Soberon, J., et al. (2002) Future projections for Mexican faunas under global climate change scenarios. *Nature*, **416**, 626-629.
- 21. Thomas, C.D., Cameron, A., Green, R.E., Bakkenes, M., Beaumont, L.J., et
- al. (2004) Extinction risk from climate change. *Nature*, **427,** 145-148.
- 22. Myers, N., Mittermeier, R.A., Mittermeier, C.G., Da Fonseca, G.A.B. & Kent,
- J. (2000) Biodiversity hotspots for conservation priorities. *Nature*, **403**, 853-858.
- 23. Cowling, R.M. & Hilton-Taylor, C. (1999) Plant biogeography, endemism and
- diversity. *The Karoo: ecological patterns and processes* (ed. by W.R.J. Dean and
- S.J. Milton), pp. 42-56. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- 24. Sala, O.E., Chapin, F.S.III, Armesto, J.J., Berlow, E., Bloomfield, J., et al.
- (2000) Global biodiversity scenarios for the year 2100. *Science*, **287**, 1770-1774.
- 25. Gordon, N.D., McMahon, T.A. & Finlayson, B.L. (1992) *Stream hydrology: An*
- *introduction for ecologists*. John Wiley & Sons, Chichester.
- 26. Thornthwaite, C.W. (1948) An approach toward a rational classification of
- climate. *Geographic Review*, **38**, 55-94.
- 27. Rosseeuw, P.J. & Yohai, V. (1984) Robust regression by means of S-
- estimates. *Lecture Notes in Statistics*, **26**, 256-272.
- 28. New, M., Lister, D., Hulme, M. & Makin, I. (2000) A high-resolution data set of surface climate over global land areas. *Climate Research*, **21**, 1-25.
- 29. Gordon, C., Cooper, C., Senior, C.A., Banks, H., Gregory, J.M., et al. (2000)
- The simulation of SST, sea ice extents and ocean heat transports in a version of the
- Hadley Centre coupled model without flux adjustments. *Climate Dynamics*, **16**, 147- 168.
- 30. Nakicenovic, N., Swart, R., editors (2000) Emissions Scenarios: A Special
- Report of Working Group III of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.
- Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 31. Thuiller, W. (2003) BIOMOD: Optimising predictions of species distributions and projecting potential future shifts under global change. *Global Change Biology*, **9**, 1353-1362.
- 
- 

# **Acknowledgements (A)**

 Graeme Ellis provided invaluable field support. Bronwyn Stiles, Nicola Berg, Trygve Cooper and Shayne Fuller also provided assistance in the field. Nathan Wells and Alison Joubert assisted with meteorological calculations. Meteorological data was provided by the South African Weather Services and the Namibian Meteorological services. This work was funded by the Centre for Applied Biodiversity Science and the South African National Biodiversity Institute. Many thanks to the communities and conservators of Namibia and the Northern Cape Province for their cooperation and hospitality.



Fig. 1

 Map showing mortality of *Aloe dichotoma* Masson populations across the species' range. Blue triangles indicate populations with low mortality and red triangles represent progressively higher mortality. Lighter and darker shades of background grey represent lower to higher altitudes (in metres) respectively. For the four northernmost populations, altitudes have been specified on the map because two of the populations occur on inselbergs. Mortality appears patchy, but a general trend of lower mortality in southern populations is apparent, irrespective of altitude, and northern populations have increasingly greater mortality, except at high altitudes.



Fig. 2

 Graph showing the relationship between latitude (degrees South) and *Aloe dichotoma* Masson population mortality. Mortality follows a latitudinal cline of increase from the poleward to the equator-ward side of the species' range, as indicated by the solid regression line (*r*=0.393, *n*=53, *P*<0.004). The mean altitudes at which these populations occur are indicated by • (<700m), ∇ (700-1000m) and (>1000m). When regressed against altitude, the residuals of the above regression produced a significant trend (*r*=0.331, *n*=53, *P*<0.016) showing that where mortality was lower than expected from the latitudinal trend, this can be explained by higher altitude of the population and conversely, that populations at low altitudes have higher than expected mortality. In combination, these results strongly suggest that *Aloe dichotoma* is undergoing the beginning of a systematic poleward and upwards range shift.



 $\overline{\mathsf{A}}$ A<br>B

 $\mathsf B$ 



C



Fig. 3

 Repeat photographs of populations of *Aloe dichotoma* Masson taken in 1904 and 1918 and precisely matched in 2002. A and B were taken at Hantamsberg, Calvinia (31°12.5' South, 19° 43.3' East) in 1904 (Marloth) and 2002 respectively. From this and another pair of matched photographs taken at the site, a decadal population increase of 109% is inferred. C and D show photographs taken in 1918 (Evans) and 2002 in the Westerberg, near Koegas (29°19.9' South, 22°18.5' East). A decadal

population decrease of 47% is inferred from 2 matched photograph pairs taken at this

site.



 Graphs showing comparisons between present and bioclimatically modelled future projections of *Aloe dichotoma's* Masson distribution range and mortality. A. shows

 the modelled frequency of *Aloe dichotoma* in each 10 minute latitude band of its range for 2000 (grey bars) and 2050 (black bars). The projected mean latitude of the species' range shifts from -26.68 ± 2.81 degrees South in 2000 to -27.90 ± 2.5 degrees South in 2050. This equates a mean altitudinal shift of 16m per decade and a poleward range shift of 23 km per decade. Graph B shows the projected relative mortality of *Aloe dichotoma* by 2050 (shaded grey), based on the relative number of existing populations occurring inside versus outside the 2050 bioclimatic envelope 444 (see methods). The dashed line represents the modelled trend of mortality; while the similarly sloped solid line represents the mortality trends measured during the population census.